

生有所缺，因「恨」而完成——評《恨！》

The Dearth of Life Will be completed through “Han”: Reviews on HAN!

劇評 Theatre Reviews by 嚴瑋擇 Yim Sai Chat, 2024-10-28

戲將完畢，演員白現珠一人坐在舞台右側，背對觀眾。燈光漸暗得慢，萬聲一時寂滅。這場獨角戲場上只有三張白幕、一張長椅。她單薄的背坐姿態越靜默，就顯得剛剛過去那一個小時裡的激烈節奏、猙獰面目有多幻滅。不禁想，她心心念念追求之「恨」最後所在何方？

The play is coming to an end, and the actress Hyun Ju Baek sits alone on the right side of the stage, facing away from the audience. The lights dim slowly, and the cacophony fades into silence. In this one-woman performance, there are only three white curtains and a long bench. Her fragile posture, sitting in silence, starkly contrasts with the intense rhythm and ferocity of the past hour, making one ponder where her long-sought "Han" ultimately resides.

Han(한): The Life-and-Death Desire Born from Hatred

한：因恨而生的生死欲力

恨在韓國文化與華文中所指的仇恨、怨恨等激越而負面的主觀印象並不一樣，一如《恨！》在簡介所引朴景利之語，「『恨』不是一個容易理解的詞語。它通常被解作一種怨恨。但我認為，它同時意味着悲傷和希望。你可以把恨看作生命的核心，它是從出生到死亡的必經之路……」

The concept of "Han" in Korean culture and in Chinese literature differs from the extreme negativity it often connotes, as noted by Park Kyung-ri in the house program to Han!: "Han" is not an easily understood term. It is usually interpreted as a form of resentment. However, I believe it simultaneously signifies sorrow and hope. You can view Han as the core of life; it is a necessary journey from birth to death..."

「恨」為何物？劇中反覆提到「恨」，但幾乎每次出現都是在結尾，作為一種情感宣洩的總結——觀眾永遠只見其在特定處境下的形貌，卻不知其實質所指，一如因見到祖母盤索里（판소리）的舞姿而在毫無準備的情況下接觸到「恨」的孫女。「祖母的所有『恨』似乎通過她的身體逐漸展開。我只是凝視著，彷彿被黑暗咒語所束縛……同時竟又感受到愛。」「恨」無處不在，好像在場的所有人都擁有恨——祖母、母親、處女鬼、甚至那個被獨留家中的小孩。擁有了恨，彷彿就可以理解生命，甚至可以理解生命背後的某種本質或意義。唯有孫女，作為敘述者的孫女，她自覺自己並不擁有「恨」，與觀眾一樣，她自身無經歷可以承載「恨」為何物的論述，她被徹底隔絕在外。

What is "Han"? The play repeatedly mentions "Han," but it mostly appears at the end, serving as a summary of emotional release—viewers only witness its manifestation in specific situations, yet unaware of its true essence, much like a granddaughter who encounters "Han" unexpectedly through her grandmother's Pansori dance. "All of her Han unravelled through her body. I just stared, as if bound by a spell... and yet in love". "Han" is omnipresent, as if everyone embodies Han—grandmother, mother, the virgin ghost, even the child left alone at home—possesses it. Having "Han" seems to provide an understanding of life, or even a glimpse into some essential meanings behind existence. Only the granddaughter, as the narrator, feels she

lacks of "Han." Like the audience, she has no experience to carry discussions about what "Han" is, and she is completely isolated.

劇中對此最激越的表達莫過於當她發現好朋友被強姦後的錯愕。那是孫女的大日子，學校的某個節日，她作為合唱團的成員練習許久。表演結束後，身邊一堆人圍著她，讚美她。她卻在人群中看到好朋友哀傷的臉，朋友告訴她，自己剛剛被強姦了，在街上，沒有人幫助她。孫女並不為其難過或哀傷或憤怒，她嫉妒，嫉妒於在她理應成為主角的大日子，她卻發現自己只是配角。「在我生命的那個階段，我以為此世是一個道場，為了使人有價值，她所經歷的痛苦會使她成為更有價值的人。...我有一種『純粹』的渴望去成為『存在』。然而，她在磨練，而我卻不在！痛苦等於偉大！所以，我朋友的命運是成為一個更高的存在.....而我的命運則是.....低於她。不！」

The most intense expression of the play occurs when she discovers her best friend has been raped. It is the granddaughter's big day, a school festival. She has practiced as a choir member for a long time. After the performance, many people surround her, praising her. Yet amidst the crowd, she sees her friend's sorrowful face; the friend tells her that she has just been raped on the street, yet no one helped her. The granddaughter does not feel sadness or anger; instead, she is jealous. On a day when she should be the center of attention, she realizes she is only a supporting character. "At that point, I thought that the world was a training studio to become a valuable human...I had such a "pure" desire to be BEING. She was in training, and I was not! Suffering equals greatness! So, her destiny was to be a higher being...and mine to be ... lower than her? No!"

那在存在中所裹覆著的又是什麼？

What is wrapped within that existence?

她渴求經歷、渴求獲知史詩般的失敗。她說，「我想成為偉大痛苦的收藏家，『恨』的收藏家。不！一個渴望成為英雄的人，揮舞著偉大的旗幟。內心的鬥爭在進行著，心中自憐讓我感受到無可替換的痛苦——與心中大聲疾呼的良知相對抗：『你在路上失去了什麼！』『恨』在此刻成為生死欲力，因期待被磨折乃至被摧毀而獲得生之映照，愛慾與死慾繼而結合。渴求的盡處是痛苦，背面則是存在。

She craves for experience, desires to grasp epic failures. She states, "I wanted to become a collector of great suffering, a collector of Han. An aspiring hero waving a majestic flag of greatness. A battle raged within, between a self-pity-laden need to see myself suffer and a conscience that was bellowing: "You have lost something along the way!" In this moment, "Han" transforms into the desire of life-and-death; through the anticipation of being worn down or even destroyed, one gains a reflection of life, with the desire of love and death intertwining. The endpoint of desire is pain, and its opposite is existence.

女子在新婚之夜就被遺棄，傳統時代的語境下無法再婚，亦意味著無法可懷有孩子。「看著孤寂的存在，滿懷悲痛與哀傷，無盡地背負著她無可承受的痛苦——恨！」她變成處女鬼，以鬼魂之身永遠行走而無法死去、永遠追

逐而無可觸碰。她因沒有孩子而無法進入輪迴，永世無安息之日。沒有孩子是她永恆的「恨」之起源，但她的「恨」又不止於孩子，從中可窺探到的，是一個時代「讓人非如此不可」的存活規限，那是一種被隔絕於世的孤寂。

A woman is abandoned on her wedding night. Under the traditional context, it means she cannot remarry, which also implies she cannot have children. "Looking at the lonely existence, filled with grief and sorrow, endlessly bearing her unbearable pain—Han!" She becomes a virgin ghost, forever wandering in a ghostly form, unable to die, eternally pursuing yet never able to touch. Her inability to have children prevents her from entering the cycle of reincarnation, leaving her without a day of rest. The absence of children is the root of her eternal "Han," but her "Han" extends beyond that, revealing a survival limitation imposed by an era that insists people must live this way—an isolation from the world.

從被獨留在家的幼孩身上可以見到更真確的遺棄與隔絕。「想象一下！她醒來了。一切皆靜，讓人窒息的靜。她哭了嗎？不，因為她很快就意識到，無人關心她哭。只有她那個搖搖欲墜的玩具……就在我眼前，這個小生靈經歷了原初的失落！沒有與人的連結。就在這裡，我告訴你！在那個小小的籃子里，她發現了分裂……那種存在於我們所有人與世界之間的鴻溝！甚至在還不知道『孤獨』意味著什麼之前，她就知道自己就是孤獨！在那裡……恨！」

From the child left alone at home, we can see a more accurate portrayal of abandonment and isolation. "Imagine! She woke up. Everything was so boringly quiet. Did she cry first? No, because she realised there was nobody there concerned with her crying. Only her roly-poly toy quietly wobbling in the room... It was there, under my eyes that she experienced the fall from grace! Un-bonded. Right there she discovered the divide...that gulf that exists between all of us and the world! And before even knowing what "solitary" meant, she knew that she was it! And there... Han!"

一如韓國前總統金大中所言，「誠然，在整個歷史過程中，我們一直生活在『恨』之中。但是，或許正因為我們心懷家國『恨』，反而一貫能夠安慰和激勵自己，因而一直能夠為了未來而生活。...對根本無法抗拒的命運，他們暫時退讓，但他們始終懷著希望並等待著，在等待期間又不放過東山再起的機會。他們忍受著巨大的困難，千方百計地堅持下去。這就是『恨』的本質。」存在背後，是與世界產生連結的渴求，更具體地指涉，是人進入集體意識之本能趨向。「恨」在其中承載了「他者即地獄」中二律背反的存在意義：它既是存在痛苦之根源，也是與世有所關聯的先設條件；眾生既在「恨」的集體意識中被共同地客體化，卻又因「恨」而產生的民族情緒而被使孤獨的個體可在語言的飛地中被承接、包裹。

As former South Korean President Kim Dae-jung said, "Indeed, throughout history, we have lived in 'Han.' However, perhaps because we harbor 'Han' for our country, we are consistently able to comfort and inspire ourselves, and thus we can continue to live for the future. ... In the face of an inescapable fate, they temporarily retreat, yet they always hold on to hope and wait, during which time they do not miss the opportunity to rise again. They endure tremendous hardships and persist in all possible ways. This is the essence of 'Han.'" Behind existence is a yearning to connect with the world, which specifically refers to humanity's instinctual tendency towards collective consciousness. 'Han' carries within it the existential paradox of "the other is hell": it is both the root of existential pain and a necessary condition for connection with the

world; beings are collectively objectified within the consciousness of 'Han,' yet it is this very 'Han' that generates a national sentiment that allows lonely individuals to be embraced and wrapped within the enclave of language.

The Continuity and Fulfillment of 'Han' in Life 「恨」在生命的承續與完成

首爾大學的社會學家金璟東教授在其論文《南韓發展的特色》中指出，「恨」是在韓國近百年歷史當中所形成的一種特殊文化心理特質，繼而融合到韓國人民的情緒和行為體系裡頭，甚至變成一個具有主宰力量的感情。「恨」作為韓國民族「共同體」的情緒，作為他們試圖保護自己的民族、國家，以及生存權利的慾力，大部分韓國人認為這樣的情緒為韓國人固有的一部分，無法被翻譯更遑論理解。

Professor Kyong Dong Kim, a sociologist at Seoul National University, pointed out in his paper "Characteristics of South Korea's Development" that 'Han' is a unique cultural psychological trait formed in South Korea over the past century, which has integrated into the emotional and behavioral systems of the Korean people, even becoming a dominant sentiment. As the sentiment of the Korean national 'community,' 'Han' represents their desire to protect their nation, country, and rights to existence. Most Koreans believe that this sentiment is an inherent part of being Korean, impossible to translate or even to understand.

這種處境落在《恨！》中，如何透過劇場語言呈現「恨」則變成它需回答之問題，這題不僅面向觀眾，亦面向創作團隊本身。呈現《恨！》的藝術團隊是來自義大利的Theatre No Theatre，導演Thomas Richards來自美國。在演後訪談中，Richards提到，團隊中只有演員白現珠是亞洲人，其餘成員各來自智利、哥倫比亞、法國等地。白現珠說自己跟這個團隊合作了六年，她說，「這六年來我學到的是，這個作品不屬於我，也不屬於我的情感。重要的，情感要隨隨文本流動。」

This context falls into the realm of HAN! and how to present 'Han' through theatrical language becomes a question that the creation must answer. It is directed not only at the audience but also at the creative team. The artistic team presenting HAN! comes from Italy, with director Thomas Richards hailing from the United States. In a post-performance interview, Richards mentioned that only one team member, actress Hyun Ju Baek, is Asian, while the others are from Chile, Colombia, France, and other places. Hyun Ju Baek said that after six years of collaboration, she learned that this work does not belong to her or her emotions. "What matters is that emotions flow with the text."

Richards說，「我不知道是否能透過「恨」來理解、總結韓國歷史。但痛苦是生活中必然會出現之物，是我們的共同經驗。那是仇恨嗎？那不是，那時隱藏在痛苦之下的自我膨脹，痛苦本身賦予了主角建構自我的方法。幾乎可以說，我越是受苦，我就越是一個深刻的人。背後要問的是，為何痛苦在這個過程無法維持它的本質，這源自於「恨」，但又不止於此。」

Richards stated, "I don't know if 'Han' can help us understand or summarize the history of Korea. But pain is something that inevitably appears in life; it is our shared experience. Is that hatred? No, it is a kind of self-aggrandisement that hides beneath the pain. The pain itself gives the protagonist a way to construct herself. It can almost be said that the more I suffer, the

deeper I become. The underlying question is why pain cannot maintain its essence in this process; it originates from 'Han,' but is not limited to that.”

Richards提到創作過程之來回反覆，不是白現珠一個人在電腦上寫完整套劇本然後表現，許多時候她想到十分鐘的文本，就即興表演，團隊記錄下來，來回磋商、討論，最後才有整套劇本。有時候團隊明白，大部分時候不理解，但人本身具有足夠的複雜性去容納這樣的不理解。「人的內心有著巨大的複雜性。例如快樂，快樂的基本部分就是悲傷。試想像，當人與愛人在一起，儘管快樂，但內心總會有一部分知道，隨著我在生活中的成長，這段關係隨時會結束。在體驗幸福的同時，內心深處卻總是苦樂交織難分的。」

Richards discussed the iterative nature of the creative process. It wasn't just Hyun Ju Baek writing a complete script on her own and then performing. Many times, she would come up with ten minutes of text and perform it improvisationally; the team would record it, discuss, and negotiate before finally arriving at a complete script. Sometimes the team understood, most of the time they did not, but human beings possess enough complexity to accommodate such mystery. "The human heart has tremendous complexity. For example, happiness—its fundamental component is sadness. Imagine when a person is with a loved one, even though they are happy, there is always a part of them that knows this relationship could end at any moment as they grow in life. While experiencing happiness, there is always a deep intertwining of joy and suffering.”

白現珠在舞台上的表演渴求痛苦，諷刺的是，她的痛苦正來源於她對痛苦的渴求，換言之，她所渴望的，正是她所經歷的。她所欠缺的其實不是痛苦，而是她想象中痛苦的理形，一種英雄獻身式的、被注視的、可被命運複述的痛苦。這種理形或來源於祖母所處封建時代的規限、或來源於母親對家庭的奉獻，在強調個人主義的當代，所尋找的痛苦欠缺大敘事下對個體感受理所當然的壓抑與忽視，Richards說，「這其實是一種尋找，不停在問，我是誰、我是誰、我是誰。」

The performance of Hyun Ju Baek on stage craves for pain; ironically, her suffering stems from her desire for pain. In other words, what she longs for is precisely what she experiences. What she lacks is not pain itself, but the ideal form of pain she imagines—a heroic-sacrificial, regarding, and fateful pain that can be retold. This ideal may arise from the constraints of her grandmother's feudal era or from her mother's dedication to the family. In this age of individualism, the search for pain is suppressed and neglected under the grand narratives that emphasize individual experience. As Richards states, "This is essentially a search, constantly asking, 'Who am I? Who am I? Who am I?'"

從劇中穿插白現珠激越的歌唱亦可見這種尋找的情感，她說，「唱這些歌時我感受到一種強烈的生活欲望。例如裡面一首葬禮歌，我小時候在鄉下牽著奶奶走時，遇上一場葬禮的禮儀隊，他們抬著一口棺材，棺材上裝飾著花朵，那時候我在想，奶奶在想些什麼呢？」代際傳承未必每次都有形貌，許多時候是潛移默化地影響我們。

Richards說，「現代與傳統根源的聯繫在這一代人開始消亡，這並不意味著傳統消逝，相反，它依舊存在，只是變得無根，我們不知何故，一如劇中的『恨』。我們不知可以如何建立與它們的聯繫，那是已然消逝的時代在我們身上的殘留物，只是我們時時未能理解。」

The intense singing interspersed throughout the play also reflects this search for identity. Hyun Ju Baek expresses, "When I sing these songs, I feel a strong desire for life. For example, there is a funeral song that I sang. I remember when I was a child, walking with my grandmother in the countryside, and we came across a funeral procession. They were carrying a coffin adorned with flowers, and I wondered, what was my grandmother thinking at that moment?" Intergenerational transmission may not always manifest visibly; often, it subtly influences us. Richards notes, "The connection between modernity and traditional roots is starting to fade in this generation. This doesn't mean that tradition has vanished; on the contrary, it still exists but has become rootless. We don't quite know how to establish connections with it, much like the 'Han' in the play. We don't know how to relate to what has already faded; it remains a residue of a bygone era that we often fail to comprehend."

《恨！》最精彩的演繹不止在於它試圖召喚無根的傳統，附身在意義缺失的現代個體身上，而在於最後，孫女重遇已逝祖母之靈，祖母對她說：「今日你接受，明日你克服。噢，我的孫女，你需要出發，出發而後看見。讓『恨』帶領你。我們會在某地重逢，到時你再教我，我曾經是誰。」生命從中真正地跨越三代人的歷史之限，讓『恨』不只成為一代人的民族情緒，而透過彼此對生命經歷的不同體認而承續、完成生命的不完美，超越人類本身所受的時間限制。

The most brilliant aspect of HAN! lies not only in its attempt to summon rootless traditions embodied in modern individuals lacking meaning but also in the climactic moment when the granddaughter encounters the spirit of her deceased grandmother. The grandmother tells her, "Today you accept, tomorrow you overcome. Oh, my granddaughter, you need to go, go and see! Let Han carry you. And when we will meet again, there, teach me what I was." Life truly transcends the historical limits of three generations, allowing "Han" to become not just a national sentiment of one generation, but a continuation that completes the imperfection of life through differing understandings of experiences.

「當這段文本出現時，我完全無從思考。它深刻到...我不知道它的意思，但又完全明白它的意思。」在語境脈絡上無法被轉譯亦無法被理解的「恨」，越過語言本身，以劇場的處境抵達導演Richards身上。「那與犧牲、痛苦與謙卑有關。祖母一生是痛苦的，在『恨』的語境下她有著深刻的人生。但她卻在這句對白裡承認自己是失敗的，她承認她並不知道自己曾經是誰，那樣深刻的痛苦與孫女一樣虛無。她對女兒做出邀請——你去實現自己，在你的實現中，我亦因你的完整而完整。這不僅再是具體的集體記憶，而抵達一種深層次的集體性。」

"When this text appeared, I was completely at a loss. It's so profound that... I don't know what it means, yet I understand it completely." The "Han" that cannot be translated or understood within its contextual framework transcends language itself, reaching the director Richards through theatre. "It relates to sacrifice, suffering, and humility. The grandmother's life was filled with pain, and in the context of 'Han,' she had a profound life. But she admits in this line that she is a failure; she acknowledges that she does not know who she once was, and that deep pain feels as void as her granddaughter's. She invites her daughter—'You go and fulfill yourself; in your fulfillment, I will also find my completeness.' This is not just a concrete collective memory, but reaches a profound sense of collectivity."

《恨！》是香港演藝博覽「國際精品演出」之一。

HAN! is one of the "International Showcase" at the Hong Kong Performing Arts Expo.